

General Docket
United States Court of Appeals for the Fourth Circuit

Court of Appeals Docket #: 16-2350 **Docketed:** 11/28/2016
Nature of Suit: 3480 Consumer Credit **Termed:** 07/25/2017
James Jenkins v. Adam Bezer
Appeal From: United States District Court for the Eastern District of Virginia at Richmond
Fee Status: fee paid

Case Type Information:

- 1) Civil Private
- 2) private
- 3) null

Originating Court Information:

District: 0422-3 : [3:15-cv-00443-MHL](#)
Court Reporter: Richard Banke, Court Reporter Coordinator
Court Reporter: Diane Daffron, Official Court Reporter
Presiding Judge: M. Hannah Lauck, U. S. District Court Judge
Date Filed: 07/28/2015

Date Order/Judgment:	Date Order/Judgment EOD:	Date NOA Filed:	Date Rec'd COA:
10/31/2016	10/31/2016	11/25/2016	11/28/2016

Prior Cases:

None

Current Cases:

	Lead	Member	Start	End
Related	16-2350	16-2351	11/28/2016	
	16-2350	17-1687	06/01/2017	

JAMES JENKINS, on behalf of himself and all other similarly situated individuals
Plaintiff - Appellee

Leonard Anthony Bennett
Direct: 757-930-3660
Email: lenbennett@clalegal.com
[**COR NTC Retained**]
CONSUMER LITIGATION ASSOCIATES, P.C.
Suite 1A
763 J. Clyde Morris Boulevard
Newport News, VA 23601

Matthew James Erausquin, Trial Attorney
Direct: 703-273-7770
Email: matt@clalegal.com
[**COR NTC Retained**]
CONSUMER LITIGATION ASSOCIATES
Suite 600
1800 Diagonal Road
Alexandria, VA 22314

James A. Francis, Esq.
Direct: 215-735-8600
Email: jfrancis@consumerlawfirm.com
[**On Brief**]
FRANCIS & MAILMAN, P.C.
19th Floor
Land Title Building
100 South Broad Street
Philadelphia, PA 19110

Elizabeth W. Hanes
Direct: 757-930-3660
Email: elizabeth@clalegal.com
[**COR NTC Retained**]
CONSUMER LITIGATION ASSOCIATES, P.C.
Suite 1A
763 J. Clyde Morris Boulevard
Newport News, VA 23601

Kristi Cahoon Kelly
Direct: 703-424-7570
Email: kkelly@kellyguzzo.com
[On Brief]
KELLY GUZZO PLC
Suite 202
3925 Chain Bridge Road
Fairfax, VA 22030

Craig Carley Marchiando
Direct: 757-930-3660
Email: craig@clalegal.com
[NTC Retained]
CONSUMER LITIGATION ASSOCIATES, P.C.
Suite 1A
763 J. Clyde Morris Boulevard
Newport News, VA 23601

Donovan C. Bezer
Direct: 201-677-8693
Email: bezer.law@gmail.com
[COR NTC Retained]
LAW OFFIC OF DONOVAN BEZER
30 Park Avenue
Lyndhurst, NJ 07071

John Jacob Pentz, III, Esq.
Direct: 978-261-5725
Email: jjpentz3@gmail.com
[COR NTC Retained]
19 Widow Rites Lane
Sudbury, MA 01776

ADAM BEZER
Party-in-Interest - Appellant

NATASHA THOMAS, on behalf of herself and all other similarly
situated individuals
Plaintiff

KEITH BOHANNON, on behalf of himself and all other similarly
situated individuals
Plaintiff

HAMPTON BROWN, on behalf of himself and other similary
situated individuals
Plaintiff

RACHEL SIMMS, on behalf of herself and all other similarly
situated individuals
Plaintiff

CONNIE VOSS, on behalf of herself and all other similarly situated
individuals
Plaintiff

CAROLYN CLARK, on behalf of herself and all other similary
situated individuals
Plaintiff

JAMES NEILL, on behalf of himself and all other similarly situated
individuals
Plaintiff

NATHANIEL LEWIS, on behalf of herself and all other similarly
situated individuals
Plaintiff

v.

EQUIFAX INFORMATION SERVICES, LLC

Zachary Andrew McEntyre

Defendant - Appellee

16-2350 Docket

Direct: 404-572-4600
Email: zmcentyre@kslaw.com
[COR NTC Retained]
KING & SPALDING, LLP
1180 Peachtree Street, NE
Atlanta, GA 30309-3521

John Willard Montgomery, Jr.
Direct: 804-355-8744
Email: jmontgomery@jwm-law.com
[NTC Retained]
MONTGOMERY & SIMPSON, LLLP
Suite A-1
2116 Dabney Road
Richmond, VA 23230-0000

Phyllis Buchen Sumner
Direct: 404-572-4799
Email: psumner@kslaw.com
[COR NTC Retained]
KING & SPALDING, LLP
1180 Peachtree Street, NE
Atlanta, GA 30309-3521

JAMES JENKINS, on behalf of himself and all other similarly situated individuals

Plaintiff - Appellee

and

EQUIFAX INFORMATION SERVICES, LLC

Defendant - Appellee

v.


ADAM BEZER


Party-in-Interest - Appellant

and

NATASHA THOMAS, on behalf of herself and all other similarly situated individuals; KEITH BOHANNON, on behalf of himself and all other similarly situated individuals; HAMPTON BROWN, on behalf of himself and other similiary situated individuals; RACHEL SIMMS, on behalf of herself and all other similarly situated individuals; CONNIE VOSS, on behalf of herself and all other similarly situated individuals; CAROLYN CLARK, on behalf of herself and all other similiary situated individuals; JAMES NEILL, on behalf of himself and all other similarly situated individuals; NATHANIEL LEWIS, on behalf of herself and all other similarly situated individuals

Plaintiffs

- 11/28/2016 [1](#) Case docketed. Originating case number: 3:15-cv-00443-MHL. Case manager: JMoore. [16-2350] JHM [Entered: 11/28/2016 03:59 PM]
2 pg, 11.3 KB
- 11/28/2016 [2](#) INFORMAL BRIEFING ORDER filed.. Informal Opening Brief due 12/22/2016 Informal response brief, if any: 17 days after informal opening brief filed. [16-2350] JHM [Entered: 11/28/2016 04:15 PM]
12 pg, 51.54 KB
- 11/30/2016 [3](#) APPEARANCE OF COUNSEL (Local Rule 46(c)) by John J Pentz for Adam Bezer.[999978194] [16-2350] John Pentz [Entered: 11/30/2016 11:42 AM]
1 pg, 44.39 KB
- 11/30/2016 [4](#) ORDER filed [999978485] rescinding informal briefing Copies to all parties.. [16-2350] JHM [Entered: 11/30/2016 03:18 PM]
2 pg, 9.32 KB
- 11/30/2016 [5](#) DOCKETING NOTICE issued Re: [1](#)] case docketed Initial forms due within 14 days. Originating case number: 3:15-cv-00443-MHL.. [16-2350] JHM [Entered: 11/30/2016 03:32 PM]
7 pg, 38.63 KB
- 12/01/2016 [6](#) DISCLOSURE OF CORPORATE AFFILIATIONS (Local Rule 26.1) by Appellant Adam Bezer. Was any question on Disclosure Form answered yes? No [999979488] [16-2350] John Pentz [Entered: 12/01/2016 05:55 PM]
2 pg, 42.92 KB
- 12/01/2016 [7](#) DOCKETING STATEMENT by Appellant Adam Bezer. [16-2350] John Pentz [Entered: 12/01/2016 05:56 PM]
4 pg, 100.61 KB
- 12/02/2016 [8](#) BRIEFING ORDER filed.. Opening Brief and Appendix due 01/11/2017. Response Brief due 02/10/2017 [16-2350] JHM [Entered: 12/02/2016 08:04 AM]
2 pg, 16.72 KB
- 12/08/2016 [9](#) APPEARANCE OF COUNSEL (Local Rule 46(c)) for James Jenkins.[999983302] [16-2350] Leonard Bennett [Entered: 12/08/2016 02:35 PM]
1 pg, 377.24 KB
- 12/08/2016 [10](#) DISCLOSURE OF CORPORATE AFFILIATIONS (Local Rule 26.1) by Appellee James Jenkins. Was any question on Disclosure Form answered yes? No [999983304] [16-2350] Leonard Bennett [Entered: 12/08/2016 02:36 PM]
2 pg, 526.81 KB
- 12/09/2016 [11](#) APPEARANCE OF COUNSEL (Local Rule 46(c)) by Phyllis Buchen Sumner for Equifax Information Services, LLC.[999984358] [16-2350] Phyllis Sumner [Entered: 12/09/2016 05:50 PM]
1 pg, 43.83 KB
- 12/09/2016 [12](#) DISCLOSURE OF CORPORATE AFFILIATIONS (Local Rule 26.1) by Appellee Equifax Information Services, LLC. Was any question on Disclosure Form answered yes? Yes [999984363] [16-2350] Phyllis Sumner [Entered: 12/09/2016 06:20 PM]
2 pg, 67.23 KB
- 12/13/2016 [13](#) APPEARANCE OF COUNSEL (Local Rule 46(c)) by Matthew J. Erasquin for James Jenkins.[999985684] [16-2350] Matthew Erasquin [Entered: 12/13/2016 10:05 AM]
1 pg, 663.39 KB
- 12/13/2016 [14](#) APPEARANCE OF COUNSEL (Local Rule 46(c)) by Zachary Andrew McEntyre for Equifax Information Services, LLC.[999985974] [16-2350] Zachary McEntyre [Entered: 12/13/2016 12:04 PM]
1 pg, 47.13 KB
- 12/13/2016 [15](#)  APPEARANCE OF COUNSEL (Local Rule 46(c)) for James Jenkins.[999986211] [16-2350] Craig Marchiando [Entered: 12/13/2016 03:06 PM]
0 pg, 0 KB
- 12/13/2016 [16](#) APPEARANCE OF COUNSEL (Local Rule 46(c)) for James Jenkins.[999986261] [16-2350] Elizabeth Hanes [Entered: 12/13/2016 03:19 PM]
1 pg, 392.3 KB
- 12/14/2016 [17](#) Docket correction requested from Craig Carley Marchinado for James Jenkins. Re: [15](#)] appearance of counsel. Access to appearance of counsel has been restricted to case participants. [16-2350] TW [Entered: 12/14/2016 07:55 AM]
2 pg, 17.15 KB
- 12/22/2016 [18](#) Initial mediation conference scheduled. [16-2350] MRB [Entered: 12/22/2016 12:24 PM]
7 pg, 31.37 KB
- 01/18/2017 [19](#) APPEARANCE OF COUNSEL (Local Rule 46(c)) by Donovan Bezer, pro hac vice for Adam Bezer. [1000005565] [16-2350] Donovan Bezer [Entered: 01/18/2017 10:50 AM]
1 pg, 529.6 KB
- 01/18/2017 [20](#) RULE 45 NOTICE issued to Mr. John Jacob Pentz, III, Esq. for Adam Bezer re: failure to file brief and appendix Case will be dismissed if default is not cured within 15 days.. [16-2350] JHM [Entered: 01/18/2017 11:25 AM]
2 pg, 15.06 KB
- 01/19/2017 [21](#) ORDER filed [1000006504] extending filing time for opening brief and appendix until 01/20/17, updating/resuming briefing order deadlines. Opening brief and appendix due 01/20/2017. Response brief due 02/21/2017 Copies to all parties.. [16-2350] JHM [Entered: 01/19/2017 10:35 AM]
2 pg, 9.57 KB
- 01/20/2017 [22](#) BRIEF by Appellant Adam Bezer in electronic and paper format. Type of Brief: OPENING. Method of Filing Paper Copies: mail. Date Paper Copies Mailed, Dispatched, or Delivered to Court: 01/24/2016. [1000007664] [16-2350] John Pentz [Entered: 01/20/2017 01:25 PM]
40 pg, 831.58 KB
- 01/20/2017 [23](#) FULL ELECTRONIC APPENDIX and full paper appendix by Appellant Adam Bezer. Method of Filing Paper Copies: mail. Date paper copies mailed dispatched or delivered to court: 01/21/2017. [1000007665] [16-2350] John Pentz [Entered: 01/20/2017 01:26 PM]
150 pg, 3.36 MB

- 01/20/2017 24 OPENING BRIEF (PAPER) file-stamped, on behalf of Adam Bezer. Number of pages: [40]. Sufficient: YES. Number of Copies: [1]. Entered on Docket Date: 02/01/2017. Received by clerk date: 01/24/2017. [1000014675] [16-2350] JHM [Entered: 02/01/2017 08:32 AM]
- 01/20/2017 25 APPENDIX (PAPER) file-stamped, on behalf of Adam Bezer. Total number of volumes (including any sealed): 1. Total number of pages in all volumes: 150. Total number of sealed volumes: 0. Sufficient? Yes. CD/DVD/Other exhibit? No. Number of Copies: 1. Entered on Docket Date: 02/01/2017. Received by clerk date: 01/24/2017. [1000014679] [16-2350] JHM [Entered: 02/01/2017 08:36 AM]
- 02/16/2017 [26](#)
4 pg, 91.56 KB MOTION by Appellee James Jenkins file supplemental appendix.. Date and method of service: 02/16/2017 ecf. [1000024897] [16-2350] Leonard Bennett [Entered: 02/16/2017 09:57 AM]
- 02/16/2017 [27](#)
1 pg, 8.77 KB NOTICE ISSUED to Donovan C. Bezer for Adam Bezer and Mr. John Jacob Pentz, III, Esq. for Adam Bezer requesting response to Motion to file supplemental appendix [[26](#)]. Response due: 02/27/2017. [1000025209]. [16-2350] TW [Entered: 02/16/2017 01:01 PM]
- 02/16/2017 [28](#)
3 pg, 78.11 KB RESPONSE/ANSWER by Adam Bezer to notice requesting response [[27](#)], Motion to file supplemental appendix [[26](#)]. [16-2350] John Pentz [Entered: 02/16/2017 02:13 PM]
- 02/17/2017 [29](#)
2 pg, 10.07 KB ORDER filed [1000025670] granting Motion to file supplemental appendix [[26](#)] Copies to all parties.. [16-2350] MR [Entered: 02/17/2017 09:17 AM]
- 02/21/2017 [30](#)
67 pg, 1.59 MB BRIEF by Appellees Equifax Information Services, LLC and James Jenkins in electronic and paper format. Type of Brief: RESPONSE. Method of Filing Paper Copies: hand delivery. Date Paper Copies Mailed, Dispatched, or Delivered to Court: 02/21/2017. [1000027451] [16-2350] Leonard Bennett [Entered: 02/21/2017 03:45 PM]
- 02/21/2017 [31](#)
243 pg, 8.65 MB Supplemental FULL ELECTRONIC APPENDIX and full paper appendix by Appellees Equifax Information Services, LLC and James Jenkins. Method of Filing Paper Copies: hand delivery. Date paper copies mailed dispatched or delivered to court: 02/21/2017. [1000027455] [16-2350] Leonard Bennett [Entered: 02/21/2017 03:49 PM]
- 02/21/2017 32 RESPONSE BRIEF (PAPER) file-stamped, on behalf of Equifax Information Services, LLC and James Jenkins. Number of pages: [67]. Sufficient: YES. Number of Copies: [1]. Entered on Docket Date: 02/24/2017. Received by clerk date: 02/21/2017. [1000030627] [16-2350] JHM [Entered: 02/24/2017 02:57 PM]
- 02/21/2017 33 SUPPLEMENTAL APPENDIX (PAPER) file-stamped on behalf of Equifax Information Services, LLC and James Jenkins. Sealed volume: N. Total number of volumes (including any sealed): 1. Total number of pages in all volumes: 243. CD/DVD/Other exhibit? N. Number of Copies: [1]. Entered on Docket Date: 02/24/2017. Received by clerk date: 02/21/2017. [1000030630] [16-2350] JHM [Entered: 02/24/2017 03:00 PM]
- 03/07/2017 [34](#)
20 pg, 409.14 KB BRIEF by Appellant Adam Bezer in electronic and paper format. Type of Brief: REPLY. Method of Filing Paper Copies: mail. Date Paper Copies Mailed, Dispatched, or Delivered to Court: 03/07/2017. [1000036893] [16-2350] John Pentz [Entered: 03/07/2017 09:25 AM]
- 03/07/2017 35 REPLY BRIEF (PAPER) file-stamped, on behalf of Adam Bezer. Number of pages: [20]. Sufficient: YES. Number of Copies: [1]. Entered on Docket Date: 03/15/2017. Received by clerk date: 03/14/2017. [1000042546] [16-2350] JHM [Entered: 03/15/2017 09:45 AM]
- 07/14/2017 [36](#)
2 pg, 16.83 KB CASE TENTATIVELY CALENDARED for oral argument during the 10/24/17 - 10/26/17 argument session. Additional copies due: 07/19/2017. Notify Clerk's Office of any scheduling conflict by: 07/24/2017. [16-2350] JLC [Entered: 07/14/2017 03:49 PM]
- 07/17/2017 37 Additional copies of the RESPONSE BRIEF and SUPPLEMENTAL JOINT APPENDIX received from Equifax Information Services, LLC and James Jenkins. [16-2350] AD [Entered: 07/17/2017 12:49 PM]
- 07/20/2017 38 Additional copies of the OPENING BRIEF, REPLY BRIEF, and JOINT APPENDIX received from Adam Bezer. [16-2350] AC [Entered: 07/20/2017 11:56 AM]
- 07/21/2017 
1 pg, 8.45 KB CASE REMOVED FROM TENTATIVE CALENDAR TO MATURE. [16-2350] JLC [Entered: 07/21/2017 03:25 PM]
- 07/24/2017 [39](#)
3 pg, 231.8 KB MOTION by Appellant Adam Bezer to dismiss appeal pursuant to FRAP 42(b) [[39](#)]. Date and method of service: 07/24/2017 ecf. [1000124340] [16-2350] John Pentz [Entered: 07/24/2017 05:46 PM]
- 07/25/2017 [40](#)
2 pg, 9.38 KB ORDER filed [1000124604] granting Motion to dismiss appeal pursuant to FRAP 42(b) [[39](#)] Copies to all parties.. [16-2350] JHM [Entered: 07/25/2017 09:20 AM]
- 07/25/2017 [41](#)
2 pg, 10.12 KB Rule 42(b) mandate issued. Originating case number: 3:15-cv-00443-MHL.. [16-2350] JHM [Entered: 07/25/2017 09:23 AM]